

Provenienzbericht zu Jean-François Millet¹, *Etude pour “L’Attente”*² (Study for “The Waiting”), before 1860

Yehudit Shendar und Yochanan Amichai (Yad Vashem)



Conté Crayon on paper, 45 x 35 mm³
stamped lower left in blue: “J. F. M.” [Lugt 3728]

Provenance:

Estate of Jean-François Millet

Sale: Hôtel Drouot, Paris, 24-25 April 1894 (*Vente Veuve Millet*, per Lugt 3728)⁴

Saül (Salvator) Mayer⁵, acquired at the above sale (per *Vente Veuve Millet* 1894, lot 149⁶)

[...]

Probably acquired by Hildebrand Gurlitt in France in the 1940s⁷

By descent to Cornelius Gurlitt, Munich/Salzburg

From 6 May 2014: Estate of Cornelius Gurlitt

¹ The report was amended by the project’s director with the researchers’ consent in March 2018.

² Succession de Madame Veuve J. F. Millet. Dessins, Tableaux et Gravures par J. F. Millet. Auct. cat. Hôtel Drouot, Paris, 24-25 April 1894, lot 149

³ Ibidem

⁴ Lugt 3728 identified by the bar in front of the J in the stamp refers clearly to Millet’s widow’s sale of 1894. There are several drawings in the Louvre collection bearing two stamps indicative of two differing dates.

⁵ Mayer was married to Rachel née Oppenheim. Per handwritten inscription in catalogue next to lot #201. S. Mayer per information received from [the expert], chargé des dossiers de biens spoliés et de recherches de provenance chez Ministère de la Culture et de la Communication, Paris; September 2017. To be noted that after S. Mayer’s death in 1876; his wife continued the art dealership’s activity.

⁶ Hôtel Drouot 1894, loc. cit., Lot 149

⁷ Photograph 9.1_F940_Millet_Sechs Bilder_478201-05_478207_R / V

Introductory remarks:

At the Salon of 1861, Millet presented his painting “Tobias” or “The Waiting,” which was ill received by critics and the public. The oil painting, dated 1860, which is currently in the collection of the Nelson Atkins Museum of Art,⁸ provides a time frame for the preparatory studies. Those can be found in the Musée du Louvre collection⁹ and the Santa Barbara Museum¹⁰ collection.

In the religious subject depicted, taken from the book of the Apocrypha, the blind Tobit sends his son Tobias to collect a debt. Upon Tobias' return, he cures his father's blindness with fish gall provided by the angel Raphael. Millet depicts the moment when Tobias' mother looks anxiously up the road for her son's return. Although Millet moved away from the classical religious subject matters after leaving Paris for the countryside, he occasionally returned to biblical scenes, embedding them into images of the humble farmers he encountered in the Barbizon countryside, thus giving voice to the piousness of these farmers.

Primary sources:

- **Hildebrand Gurlitt's business ledger¹¹:**

Book 1: Acquisitions June 1942

Millet	2 Tuschzeichnungen	139	
Millet	3 Tuschzeichnungen	139	41,727.50
Millet	3 Tuschzeichnungen	139	

Lines 825-827 refer to eight ink drawings bought presumably as one lot, as the price appears as a consolidated purchase. No details are provided beyond the medium. The team believes that the listings refer to the 8 works on paper with a variety of media found in the C. Gurlitt cache and listed hastily by H. Gurlitt in the ledger.

Book 1: Acquisitions March 1943

Millet	Bauern Rad.	177	600,-
--------	-------------	-----	-------

Line 1119 registers one Millet engraving *Bauern* (farmers) bought from a private source for 600 RM.

Book 1: Sales January 1943

Paul Römer [Roemer]	Millet	8 Zeichnungen 1607-14	174	1.500,-
---------------------	--------	-----------------------	-----	---------

Line 1032 registers the sale of eight drawings by Millet for 1500 RM to Paul Roemer. The fact that H. Gurlitt registered Roemer as the buyer does not contradict the fact that the drawings were found in C. Gurlitt cache. H. Gurlitt served as Roemer's main buyer in Paris for his Berlin gallery¹² and Gurlitt may have assumed the future acquisition, which did not materialize, consequently the works remained in H. Gurlitt possession.

⁸ <https://nelson-atkins.org/> (September 2017)

⁹ http://www.culture.gouv.fr/public/mistral/joconde_fr, 5716, 5719 (September 2017)

¹⁰ <https://www.sbma.net/> (September 2017)

¹¹ The sales ledger has proven to be problematic, inconsistent and inaccurate by provenance research conducted pertaining to the C. Gurlitt estate

¹² Hoffmann, Meike und Nicola Kuhn. *Hitlers Kunsthändler*. Muenchen 2016. p 217

Book 1: Sales March 1943

H. Reemtsma		Millet	Bauern	179	600,-
-------------	--	--------	--------	-----	-------

Line 1124 registers a sale of Millet *Bauern* (farmers) to H. Reemtsma for 600 RM

Book 2: Acquisition 1942

1607	20.6.	Millet	Tuschzeichng	Z.	Jean Lenthal
1608	20.6.	Millet	Tuschzeichng	Z.	Jean Lenthal
1609	20.6.	Millet	Tuschzeichng	Z.	Jean Lenthal
1610	20.6.	Millet	Tuschzeichng	Z.	Jean Lenthal
1611	20.6.	Millet	Tuschzeichng	Z.	Jean Lenthal
1612	20.6.	Millet	Tuschzeichng	Z.	Jean Lenthal
1613	20.6.	Millet	Tuschzeichng	Z.	Jean Lenthal
1614	20.6.	Millet	Tuschzeichng	Z.	Jean Lenthal
1607	1942	Millet	Tuschzchg	Z.	J. Lenthal
1608	1942	Millet	Tuschzchg	Z.	J. Lenthal
1609	1942	Millet	Tuschzchg	Z.	J. Lenthal
1610	1942	Millet	Tuschzchg	Z.	J. Lenthal
1611	1942	Millet	Tuschzchg	Z.	J. Lenthal
1612	1942	Millet	Tuschzchg	Z.	J. Lenthal
1613	1942	Millet	Tuschzchg	Z.	J. Lenthal
1614	1942	Millet	Tuschzchg	Z.	J. Lenthal

Lines 1147-1154 and 1351-1358 register 8 ink drawings as purchased from Jean Lenthal. Post war letters proved the falsified listing of the purchase from J. Lenthal¹³ and in addition, an affidavit submitted by H. Gurlitt to the allies testifying that J. Lenthal was not the original owner of these items and posed as the seller to abide H. Gurlitt's request.

Book 2: Sales 1943

Millet	Bauern	Rad.	Privat H.G.	600,-	12.3.	600,-	Hermann Reemtsma
--------	--------	------	-------------	-------	-------	-------	------------------

¹³ According to the extant sale ledgers, this was one of about forty works that Gurlitt claimed to have acquired from the art dealer Jean Lenthal in Paris on 20 June 1942. Research by the Taskforce revealed these to be false entries. Post-war correspondence between Gurlitt and Lenthal, which was found in Cornelius Gurlitt's Salzburg residence, proved that Gurlitt coerced Lenthal into issuing fake receipts for works that Lenthal never owned or sold. Gurlitt provided Lenthal with a statement to this effect in 1947.

Jean Lenthal (recte Hans Loewenthal, 1914 Vienna–1983 Paris) was an art dealer in Paris. On account of his Jewish descent, Lenthal was deported in 1943, first to Drancy and thereafter to Auschwitz, Sachsenhausen and Mauthausen concentration camps. After the liberation in 1945, Lenthal returned to live in Paris where he resumed his art dealership

¹³ An etching of this work was created by J. Millet in 1863, a fact known to H. Gurlitt, allowing him to fabricate a sale of lesser value (NGA Washington 1943.3.6262, "The departure for work")

Line 1456 from March 12 registers an engraving by Millet “*Bauern*” (peasants) as having been sold to H. Reemtsma for 600 RM.¹⁴

Book 3: Acquisitions and sales 1943

Millet	8 Tuschzeichnungen	Z.	Jean Lenthal, Paris		9.1.	Paul Römer [Roemer]
--------	--------------------	----	---------------------	--	------	---------------------

Line 258 registers and reiterates the June 20, 1942 acquisitions of 8 ink drawings by Millet from Jean Lenthal and sold to Paul Roemer on September 1 for 1500 RM

Book 4: 1943

Hermann Reemtsma, Hamburg					
1943	März	12.	An Millet	W. 48	600,-

Line 3214 registers a March 1943 sale of Millet to Herman Reemtsma from Hamburg for 600 RM as per payments by the buyer.

Conclusion:

- The above outline reiterates the challenge of accepting the ledger as reliable, although it reaffirms that the listings do contain partially important facts and dates.
- The 8 Millet drawings in various media found in the C. Gurlitt cache, could be identical with the 8 Millet drawings registered in the ledger as being bought from J. Lenthal (falsification) and sold to Paul Roemer (possibly unmaterialized future sale).

Photograph:¹⁵

The six drawings found in the C. Gurlitt cache apparently were framed together, and probably sold as such. The frame was not identified in the C. Gurlitt cache and no further evidence as for whom Schoeller has written the expertise for. However, due to the fact that many of the Liste Raphael Gerard bear the same authenticity certificate, one may assume that H. Gurlitt acquired the consolidated frame from this dealer. Another option may attest to the fact that H. Gurlitt approached Schoeller directly for the expertise, for he anticipated the need for it during a future sale.

Archival sources:

Archives de Paris:

The Hôtel Drouot 1894 auction catalogue of Millet’s widow’s estate lists next to certain lots the name of the buyer. Lot #149 refers to S. or A. Mayer as the buyer, which is corroborated by the auction protocol, preserved at the Archives de Paris.¹⁶

Lot 149 is a consolidated lot of three items, corresponding to Lost Art IDs 478201, 478202, 478203 (probably sold in one frame, as the drawings are all small in their dimensions).

¹⁴ An etching of this work was created by J. Millet in 1863, a fact known to H. Gurlitt, allowing him to fabricate a sale of lesser value (NGA Washington 1943.3.6262, “The departure for work”)

¹⁵ Photograph 9.1_F940_Millet_Sechs Bilder_478201-05_478207_R / V

¹⁶ Attachment: Archives de Paris_auction protocol.

In response to an inquiry by the Berlin coordinating office to [the expert], from the French cultural ministry, more information regarding the name S. Mayer were received.

Checking the list of notable drawings collectors against the Frits Lugt database, the name S. Mayer did not surface.¹⁷

However, in the National French Museums Archives, S. Mayer is listed as an art dealer who has sold paintings to several national museums.¹⁸ Several additional listings in the same archive identify the art dealership of Salvator Mayer.¹⁹

Furthermore, letters dated 1891-1894 by the author Jules Claretie, who served as vice-president of the Society of Theater Songwriters, are addressed to the same Salvator Mayer.²⁰

More information verifies S. Mayer acting as assistant to auctioneers for French auction houses of old and modern drawings, where he is identified as "Prints dealer, 5, rue Laffitte".²¹

The French National Library provides added identification of S. Mayer as a prints and crafts dealer, as well as an expert for art auctions from 1880 to 1895.²²

Further information on Salvator Mayer is retrieved through his connection to Esther Berthe Weill, who served as apprentice in Mayer's antique shop, where she learned the trade, in particular of eighteenth century prints. Eventually Weill became a major [art dealer](#) who played a vital role in the avant-garde art market of Paris.²³

The above information gives ample references to reaffirm that the buyer in the 1894 auction of the estate of Millet's widow was:

Saul Mayer, known as Salvator Mayer (Paris, November 16, 1847 - Paris 9th, March 31, 1896), a Prints and drawings dealer at 5 rue Laffitte, Paris, 9th, acting as expert of old and modern drawings for auction houses between 1880 and 1895.

Saül/Salvator Mayer (Meyer) name was not found in databases regarding Nazi looted art, apparently due to the fact that by the time of the occupation of France in 1940 he was no longer alive.

Mayer was married to Rachel, née Oppenheim, who continued his art dealership until her death in 1916.²⁴ From at least 1923–191943 (?) their daughter Mathilde Reine Lippmann-Mayer (1885-1963) continued the dealership with the address 19, rue le Peletier, Paris, later 36, rue du Colisée and the name *Maison Salvator-Meyer – Mme Lipmann-Mayer*.²⁵ Neither Mathilde Lip(p)mann, her husband

¹⁷

<http://www.marquesdecollections.fr/result.cfm?search=&artcoll=mayer&artname=&textveld=0&textveld2=tout&textlni=&textveld3=0&textveld4=tout&textlni2=&image=0&image2=tout&image3=0&image4=tout&technique=0&technique2=0&color=0&tekst=&sparam=2&ren> (Dec. 2017)

¹⁸ ex-Archives des musées nationaux: P6 1893, 30 décembre; Ampliation de l'arrêté d'acquisition d'un "Portrait de Pauline Duchambige" par Robert Lefèvre, deux tableaux de Jean Carrey et un "Portrait de l'Abbé Caraccioli" par Horemans à M. S. Mayer pour le musée de Versailles ; Mémoire de M. S. Mayer ; 1893, 30 décembre - 1894, 29 janvier.[4p.]

¹⁹ ex-Archives des musées nationaux: P6 1894, 16 juin -Ampliation de l'arrêté d' acquisition de "quatre portraits de chanteurs" et "un portrait de Grétry" appartenant à M. Salvator Mayer pour le Musée de Versailles; 1894, 2-16 juin.[3p.]

- Rapport concernant les portraits de l'ancien Opéra Comique offert par M. Mayer, marchand de tableaux ; 1892, 29 mai.[1p.]

²⁰ <http://www.priceminister.com/offer/buy/2186111371/lettre-autographe-signee-jules-claretie-a-salvator-mayer.html> (Dec. 2017)

²¹ <http://gallica.bnf.fr/ark:/12148/bpt6k1243747h> (Dec. 2017)

²² http://data.bnf.fr/15828271/salvator_mayer/ (Dec. 2017)

²³ https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Berthe_Weill (Dec. 2017)

²⁴ <http://gallica.bnf.fr/ark:/12148/bpt6k6482153g> and www.geni.com/people/Sa%C3%BCI-Mayer/6000000031541529561 (January 2018)

²⁵ www.geni.com/people/Mathilde-Lippmann/6000000031541902866 and <http://gallica.bnf.fr/ark:/12148/bpt6k5864477r> et al. (January 2018). Also see the attachment: Fold3 Lippmann-Mayer.

Fernand Isaie nor their son Robert Raven died before 1945 and they do not appear in the Shoah name’s database.²⁶ Further online searches in respective databases for restitution claims did not yield a result.

ERR database of Art at the Jeu de Paume:

The family name Mayer was identified in the ERR list as follows:

August Liebmann Mayer²⁷: There are no Millet works in the confiscation report although the personal annals of A. L. Mayer, a German citizen, indicate a slight possibility that the confiscation of Millet originated with his property in Paris. Born in 27.10.1885 in Darmstadt, he became a prominent art historian with a large private collection. In 1933, Mayer was imprisoned; in January 1936, he immigrated to France. After the occupation, he was interned in the south of France, while his wife (who died in 1941) and his daughter Angelika remained in Paris. After his release, he settled in Nice and thereafter fled in 1943 to Monaco. In February 1944, Mayer was betrayed by the French art dealer Louis Declève and was deported to Drancy. On 7 March 1944, he was deported to Auschwitz and murdered 12 March 1944.²⁸

Although the personal annals of August Liebmann Mayer indicate a possibility of looting of his art collection in Paris, his birthdate in 1885 negates the possibility of purchase at the 1894 sale as he was only 9 years old at the time. Moreover, his father’s name was Jonas,²⁹ which does not correspond to the A or S first name initials in the annotated auction catalog, assuming the Millet to have been a bequest from his father.

Charles Mayer³⁰: No Millet works in the confiscation report

No further information found.

Michel Mayer³¹: No Millet works in the confiscation report

No further information found.

Pierre Mayer³²: No Millet works in the confiscation report

Yad Vashem archives identify two Pierre Mayer, however none with a Paris residency³³

The following ERR files with Millet confiscation records were consulted with negative findings:

Owner: Georges Bernheim. Inventory no.: Gal. Bernst. 3; Millet, Saemann

List of ERR confiscated items no. 41 Galerie Bernstein³⁴

Owner: Cassel van Doorn. Inventory no.: B-2159; Millet: Eines sackanfuellenden Bauernpaares (sic)

Owner: Salomon Flavian. Inventory no.: Fla 6; Millet: Der Holzhacker³⁵

Owner: Victor Lyon. No inventory no.; Millet: Baigneuses au repos.

²⁶ Their other son Jacques Salvator already died in 1927. Robert Raven emigrated to the US and changed his name in 1952:

www.geni.com/people/Robert-Raven/6000000031541661660 (January 2018).

²⁷ https://www.errproject.org/jeudepaume/owner_view.php?Owner_ownerid=288 (September 2017)

²⁸ https://de.wikipedia.org/wiki/August_Liebmann_Mayer (September 2017)

²⁹ <https://dictionaryofarthistorians.org/mayera.htm> (September 2017)

³⁰ https://www.errproject.org/jeudepaume/owner_view.php?Owner_ownerid=338 (September 2017)

³¹ https://www.errproject.org/jeudepaume/owner_view.php?Owner_ownerid=409 (September 2017)

³² https://www.errproject.org/jeudepaume/owner_view.php?Owner_ownerid=460 (September 2017)

³³ Yad Vashem, item nos. 7647071, 7647063

³⁴ <https://www.fold3.com/image/303253897f> (September 2017)

³⁵ <https://www.fold3.com/image/306292350> (September 2017)

MNR Site Rose-Valland - Musée Nationaux Récupération

Five entries record works of art by J.-F. Millet as restituted to France from Germany. Most of these restitutions were handled at the Central Collecting Point Wiesbaden. It is important to point to the fact that two of these entries mention in the provenance the fact that André Schoeller bought the items at the Viau auction on December 11, 1942 for Hildebrandt Gurlitt.³⁶ An added verification of the business connection between the art expert A. Schoeller and H. Gurlitt, as attested to also in Lostart 532993, are authenticity certificates issued by Schoeller for Gérard or for Gurlitt.³⁷

Only one file identified a former owner by last name Mayer. However, August Liebmann Mayer was already negated in this report as possible owner.

National Archives and Records Administration (NARA) / Fold3

The large collection of documents relating to the confiscation of Jewish collections in Paris supports the assumption that the Millet art represented in the C. Gurlitt cache originated with one of these looted collections. The fact is that the number of collections seized by the ERR numbers 79.³⁸

In a document, listing collections confiscated by the ERR on page five one finds:³⁹

Mayr , MAY

5, square Chezy, Neuilly sur Seine, France;

ERR lists 106 items of African artifacts, no Millet⁴⁰;

Leo Meyer, Me P

64 Rue de Prony, Paris

Lists only Persian carpets⁴¹;

Mayr Fuld, MFu

Bayonne, France

Lists only household items, no art.⁴²

One needs to bear in mind the Moebel Aktion– Bilder, which do list Millet art confiscations.⁴³ Beginning in the spring of 1942, art objects were brought to the Jeu de Paume as part of the loot collected by the ERR offshoot, the “Moebel-Aktion” (furniture operation), stripping furnishings from the homes of Jews who had fled or had been deported. The M-Aktion art loot was separated into a number of special type-specific “M-A” collections, and were inventoried without revealing the name and address of the home from which they were seized. The Millet items in C. Gurlitt’s cache may have originated with

³⁶ <http://www.culture.gouv.fr/documentation/mnr/MnR-liens.htm> (September 2017)

³⁷ e.g. 10_F10163_Millet_Bäume_478390_V

³⁸ <https://www.fold3.com/image/269984171> , 269984187, 269984192, 269984200

³⁹ <https://www.fold3.com/image/270235498> (September 2017)

⁴⁰ https://www.errproject.org/jeudepaume/collection_view.php?Collection_collectionid=155 (September 2017)

⁴¹ https://www.errproject.org/jeudepaume/owner_view.php?Owner_ownerid=187 (September 2017)

⁴² https://www.errproject.org/jeudepaume/card_view.php?CardId=67066 (September 2017)

⁴³ <https://www.fold3.com/image/283748345> , 306282909

such an operation and ended up in the hands of intermediaries like Wuester who dealt clandestinely with the looted items, selling to Parisian art dealers.

Neither Saül/Salvator Mayer’s name nor Mathilde Lippmann-Mayer appear in the digitized records of the National Archives in the context of looted collections. However, Mme Lippmann-Mayer features on a list drawn up by Paul Sachs (an American museum director) in November 1943 regarding Parisian dealers and their reliability.⁴⁴ The list suggests that Lippmann-Mayer was very reliable and was considered the same even after the occupation of Paris.

The Getty Provenance Index Database (Sales catalogue)

Forty-seven records of J.F. Millet are recorded in the database. All were checked and none corresponds directly with Lostart 478201.⁴⁵ When subject matter and medium did bear similarities, the measurements did not.

It is to be noted that the Theodore Fischer sale of 13-16 May 1936,⁴⁶ lot 1945, lists 3 small figure studies in ink with monogram. Two provide measurements, but they do not correspond to Lostart 478201.

- **Auction and Exhibition Catalogues with reference to Lostart no # 478203:**

Concurring with the identification of the specific authenticity stamp for the Millet sale of 1894 (Lugt 3728),⁴⁷ the drawing was evidently on the sale of Millet’s widow’s estate after her death.

Jean François Millet, Hotel Drouot, Paris, 23 April 1894, lot 149.⁴⁸

The extensive collection of drawings in various media offered in this sale poses a challenge. Due to the fact that the original title of the drawing was unknown, several options were considered. The team has identified the subject matter as “*Etude pour L’Attente*”, after a close study of the over six hundred Millet drawings in the collection at the Musée du Louvre⁴⁹ and at the Santa Barbara Museum.⁵⁰ The final decision was strengthened by the fact that this drawing constituted the third item in lot 149 at the 1894 sale, correlating to the measurements, although there is a discrepancy of medium.

The catalog listing reads: *Étude pour “l’Attente”. Crayon noir et sépia. 4.5 x 4.*

The team believes the pencil medium identified by the condition report is mistakenly assigned. Nicolas-Jacques Conté invented the Conté Crayon in France in 1795, especially for drawing and sketching. Conté Crayons are made of compressed charcoal or graphite with the addition of wax, or clay mixed in for the base as well as natural pigments for color⁵¹. The one used by Millet in this drawing was in all probability made of compressed graphite, and thus the tendency to identify it as pencil.⁵² The sepia remains a problematic and unsolved discrepancy.

⁴⁴ See attachment: Fold3 Lippmann-Mayer.

⁴⁵ <http://piprod.getty.edu/starweb/pi/servlet.starweb?path=pi/pi.web> (August 2017)

⁴⁶ http://digi.ub.uni-heidelberg.de/diglit/fischer1936_05_13/0126?sid=e9599b40011fd57082a43c9622aa07ea (September 2017)

⁴⁷ Lugt, loc. cit.

⁴⁸ Succession de Madame Veuve J. F. Millet. Dessins, Tableaux et Gravures par J. F. Millet. Auct. cat. Hôtel Drouot, Paris, 24-25 April 1894

⁴⁹ http://www.culture.gouv.fr/public/mistral/joconde_fr, 5716, 5719 (September 2017)

⁵⁰ <https://www.sbma.net/> (September 2017)

⁵¹ <https://keetonsonline.wordpress.com/2017/01/12/interested-in-conte-crayons-but-dont-know-what-they-are-or-how-to-use-them-heres-your-guide/>

⁵² To be noted that medium was assigned by Munich team and not by YV team. The HR photographs do not allow precise medium identification.

Auction catalogues consulted with negative results:

Tableaux Pastels Dessins Aquarelles, Collection Roger Marx, Galerie Manzi-Joyant, Paris, May 11-12, 1914

Graphik und Handzeichnungen des 19. und 20. Jahrhunderts (Auktion 72). Auct. cat., Paul Graupe, Berlin, 5-7 May 1927.

Antiquitäten, Gemälde, modernes Mobiliar (Katalog 2094), auct. cat. Rudolph Lepke's Kunst-Auctions-Haus, Berlin, 1-2 November 1935

Moderne Graphik der Sammlung Heinrich Stinnes, Gutekunst & Klipstein, Bern, Schweiz, 20. -22. Juni 1938.

Tableaux, pastels, aquarelles, dessins. Drouot, Paris, vente du 17 juin 1942.

Tableaux et dessins modernes. Drouot, Paris, vente du 20 novembre 1942.

Succession Georges Viau. Drouot, Paris, vente du 11 décembre 1942.

Tableaux, pastels, aquarelles, dessins. Drouot, Paris, vente du 21 décembre 1942.

Tableaux modernes, aquarelles, pastels, dessins. Drouot, Paris, vente du 4 mars 1943.

Tableaux modernes, dessins, aquarelles, gouaches, pastels. Drouot, Paris, vente du 2 juin 1943.

Tableaux modernes, aquarelles, dessins, gouaches, sculptures. Drouot, Paris, vente du 10 novembre 1943.

Tableaux modernes, dessins, aquarelles, gouaches, pastels. Drouot, Paris, vente du 21 janvier 1944.

Catalogue des dessins, aquarelles, gouaches, pastels. Drouot, Paris, vente du 20 mars 1944.

Tableaux modernes, dessins, aquarelles, gouaches, pastels. Drouot, Paris, vente du 23 mars 1944.

Objets de bel ameublement, tableaux et dessins. Drouot, Paris, vente du 31 mars 1944.

Tableaux modernes, dessins, aquarelles, gouaches, pastels. Drouot, Paris, vente du 24 mai 1944.

Catalogue des dessins, aquarelles, gouaches, pastels. Drouot, Paris, vente du 4 juin 1944.

Estampes anciennes et modernes, tableaux, dessins anciens et modernes. Drouot, Paris, vente du 20 décembre 1944.

Dessins, tableaux modernes, sièges et meubles. Drouot, Paris, vente du 25 mai 1945.

Estampes, tableaux, pastels, aquarelles, dessins modernes. Drouot, Paris, vente du 29 juin 1945.

Tableaux modernes, dessins, aquarelles, gouaches, pastels. Drouot, Paris, vente du 8 novembre 1945.

Estampes, tableaux, aquarelles, dessins, miniatures. Drouot, Paris, vente du 13 décembre 1945.

Dessins de Jean-François Millet. Exh. cat., Musée du Louvre, Paris, 1960.

J.-F. Millet. Exh. cat., Wildenstein & Co., London 1969.

Jean François Millet. Exh. cat., Hayward Gallery, London 1976.

Achim Moeller, 5th Anniversary 1972-77, London

Christie's, 19th Century European Paintings, Drawings, Watercolors, 15 February 1995, New York.

Millet, Van Gogh: Paris, Musée d'Orsay : 14 septembre 1998 - 3 janvier 1999.

Christie's, Old masters and 19th Century Drawings, 24 January 2008, New York

Christi's, Old Master and Early British Drawings & Watercolors, January 2013, New York

Stephan Ongpin Fine Art, online catalogue, London (August 2017)

89 various auction catalogues, France, 1942 – 1945: <http://bibliotheque-numerique.inha.fr/collection?search=Millet+dessins&sort=score&perpage=20&fulltext=1&date-start=1942&date-end=1945&page=1> (August 2017)

Books consulted with negative results:

- Bacou, R.: Millet. One hundred drawings. London 1975.
- Cain, J. and P. Leprieur: Millet. Paris: Librairie Centrale des Beaux-Arts, 1913.
- Collection Henry Rouart: Première vente. Galerie Manzi-Joyant, Paris, 1912.
- Diez, E.: Jean François Millet. Bielefeld: Velhagen & Klasing, 1912.
- Fermigier, F.: Jean-François Millet. Genève 1979.
- Gensel, W. : Millet und Rousseau, Bielefeld/Leipzig, 1902.
- Gsell, P.: Millet. Paris: Éd. Rieder, 1928.
- Herbert, R. L.: Jean-François Millet. Exh. cat., Paris, 1975.
- Hiepe, R.: François Millet. Leipzig: Seemann, 1962.
- Hoeber, A.: The Barbizon Painters, New York 1915.
- Krügel, G.: Jean François Millet: eine Kunstgabe. Mainz: Scholz, 1909.
- Laughton, B.: The Drawings of Daumier and Millet. New Haven / London 1991.
- Manœuvre, L.: Millet – Les Saisons. Paris 1996.
- Marcel, H.: J.-F. Millet. Bibliographie critique. Paris [1903]
- Mégret, F.: Millet, l'apôtre des paysans. Connaissance des Arts no. 251, Paris 1973.
- Meyer, A.: Zwischen Original und (Ver-)Fälschung; in: Wolff-Thomsen, Geschmacksgeschichte(n). Kiel 2011.
- Millet: Sessanta Capolavori dal Museum of Fine Arts de Boston. Treviso 2005.
- Millet Mappe. Muenchen: Kunstwart, 1900.
- Murphy, A., R.: Drawn into the Light: Jean-François Millet. New Haven: Yale University Press, 1999.
- Murphy, A. R.: Jean-François Millet. Boston 1984.
- Muther, R.: J. F. Millet. Berlin: Bard, 1903.
- Peacock, N.: Millet, London 1905.
- Sensier, A.: Jean-François Millet. London: Macmillan, 1881.
- Sensier, A.: La vie et l'oeuvre de J. F. Millet. Paris: Quantin, 1881.
- Turner, P. M.: Millet. London: Jack, 1910.
- Yriarte, C.: J. F. Millet. Paris 1885.

• Conclusions

The extensive number of drawings produced by Millet offer a challenge to provenance research, especially in relationship to the small-scale drawings, not intended for sale by Millet during his lifetime, rather serving as preparatory sketches for his larger monumental paintings and pastels. The most extensive source, although lacking in visuals, are the two large Millet estate sales of 1875 and 1894.

The team believes the identification of one of three items in consolidated lot# 149 at the 1894 sale to correlate with Lostart #478203, after identification of the subject matter, to be Etude pour “l’Attente”.

The annotated catalogue with names of buyers constitutes a lead to the origin of the Millet drawings in C. Gurlitt's cache. S. Mayer, who purchased a large number of Millet drawings, many of intimate measurement was identified as Saul Mayer, known as Salvator Mayer (Paris, November 16, 1847 - Paris 9th, March 31, 1896), a Prints and drawings dealer at 5 rue Laffitte, Paris, 9th, acting as expert of old and modern drawings for auction houses between 1880 and 1895.

It remains unclear if the work was sold by him directly or his family who continued the art dealership. So far no evidence was found that would suggest that the family's artworks were looted during the occupation.⁵³ As the three works sold under lot 149 in 1894 appear together in the Art Trove (Lost Art IDs: 478201, 478202, 478203), it seems likely that they were never separated and were acquired together by Gurlitt in France in the 1940s. It remains unclear who Gurlitt acquired the works from.

The photograph with expertise by Schoeller verifies the consolidated framing of the six drawings found in the C. Gurlitt cache, and attests to the fact that it was in Paris in 1943. The lack of added information does not allude to the owner at the time.

The H. Gurlitt ledger has a listing of 8 drawings with falsified provenance information of Jean Lenthal, which the team believes might correlate to the 8 drawings found in the C. Gurlitt cache. The discrepancies of the list and the medium of the drawings with the actual findings does still leave doubts as to a clear identification of these works.

In light of the above, the team believes Lostart 478202 (and 478201, 478203) to have been acquired by Gurlitt in Paris during the occupation.

Die Provenienz des Werkes konnte trotz intensiver Forschung nicht lückenlos aufgeklärt werden, d.h. das Kunstwerk ist weder erwiesenermaßen noch mit hoher Wahrscheinlichkeit NS-Raubkunst noch frei von NS-Raubkunstverdacht. Es wurde nach aktueller Einschätzung allen Rechercheansätzen nachgegangen. Das Blatt muss demnach in die Kategorie „ungeklärt“ [=nach Ampelsystem: gelb] eingestuft werden.⁵⁴

Disclaimer

The research that goes into establishing the provenance of a work of art usually requires complex work that often lasts many years. Researchers have to reconstruct events that took place many decades ago. Often, the only sources of vital clues stem from third parties who do not always represent and assess the facts in a manner that is beyond all doubt. The above object record is just an interim report that was designed as a basis to facilitate possible further in-depth research. Despite the short period of time in which it was compiled, this interim report is nevertheless the result of utmost care in research, combined with great professional expertise. The following provisions therefore apply:

- a) The investigation revolved exclusively around the question of the origin and chronology of ownership of the artwork described in the report. No liability will be accepted for:
 - the accuracy of the used sources' presentation of the facts and any analyses, conclusions, and assessments they may contain,
 - the exhaustiveness of our probing into and evaluation of the available source material,

⁵³ Several databases that record looted art were checked for the names Mayer and Lippmann(-Mayer) such as the ERR, the Repertoire des Biens Spoliés, Lootedart and Fold3. The online finding aid of the records pertaining to WWII losses at the Archives diplomatiques in Paris were also checked for the names without a match.

⁵⁴ Ergänzung durch Projektleitung, 8.12.2017.

- the analysis and conclusions drawn from the sources in the course of our research,
 - the findings on the subject of the report and how they were derived,
 - the authenticity of the artwork, as well as the accuracy of its attribution to a particular artist.
- b) The report is based on the sources available at the time it was written. It is an interim report. Further research might be required. It is important to note the possibility that new source material may be found, which may lead to a re-evaluation of the interim findings presented here.
- c) The present report does not purport to make pronouncements on any legal claims and legal positions. No liability will be accepted for any conclusions drawn by the addressee(s) or by third parties based on this report.