

Aus datenschutz- bzw. urheberrechtlichen Gründen erfolgt die Publikation mit Anonymisierung von Namen und ohne Abbildungen.

Provenance research report, Lost Art ID: 478051

Yehudit Shendar/Yochanan Amichai, Yad Vashem



Honoré Daumier

Portrait d’homme de trois-quart vers la gauche / Portrait of a male turning to the left ¹ 1860 (?);
double-faced

Yehudit Shendar/Yochanan Amichai, Yad Vashem

Pen and black ink on paper, 147 x 120 mm (recto sheet)

on recto: Pen and black ink and wash, monogrammed at lower left "h D", inscribed in pencil on matting at lower left: "8"

on verso: *Étude de quatre têtes masculines* / Study of four male heads,² pen and black ink, red and brown wash; inscribed in pencil on cardboard at upper right: "8"

- **Provenance**

(...)

By latest 28 April 1944: Raphaël Gerard, Paris (per CG papers)

¹ http://www.culture.gouv.fr/public/mistral/joconde_fr Musée du Louvre RF 36798 (October 2017)

² Ibid. REC 129

[Hildebrand Gurlitt (1895-1956), Düsseldorf]

[Estate of Hildebrand Gurlitt, 1956-?]

Cornelius Gurlitt (1932-2014), Munich

Estate of Cornelius Gurlitt

- **Introductory remarks:**

Honoré Daumier (1808–1879) is widely recognized by his immense production of lithographs, which have coined him as the foremost caricaturist of French politics and the one to establish the satirical portrayal of the emerging bourgeoisie. However, it is in his rarer and less recognized drawings and watercolors, intimate productions, mostly viewed as the production of the private artist created for himself, that Daumier manifests his most exceptional and unique traits as an artist, unfortunately overlooked by many scholars. Baudelaire, his contemporary, has declared Daumier to be the equal of Ingres and Delacroix. His devotion to drawings was uncommon at his time, and is viewed in retrospect as revolutionary, reinventing a lost medium.

“Nous ne connaissons, à Paris, que deux hommes qui dessinent aussi bien que M. Delacroix, l’un d’une manière analogue, l’autre dans une méthode contraire. - L’un est M. Daumier, le caricaturiste ; l’autre, M. Ingres, le grand peintre, l’adorateur rusé de Raphaël. - Voilà certes qui doit stupéfier les amis et les ennemis, les séides et les antagonistes; mais avec une attention lente et studieuse, cha-cun verra que ces trois dessins différents ont ceci de commun, qu’ils rendent parfaite-ment et complètement le côté de la nature qu’ils veulent rendre, et qu’ils disent juste ce qu’ils veulent dire. - Daumier dessine peut-être mieux que Delacroix, si l’on veut pré-férer les qualités saines, bien portantes, aux facultés étranges et étonnantes d’un grand génie malade de génie; M. Ingres, si amoureux du détail, dessine peut-être mieux que tous les deux, si l’on préfère les finesses laborieuses à l’harmonie de l’ensemble, et le caractère du morceau au caractère de la composition, mais aimons-les tous les trois.”³

Thanks to the 1968 published catalogue raisonné by K.E. Maison,⁴ over eight hundred drawings by Daumier have been identified, in comparison to the thousands of lithographs. An important segment of this output was on display at the 1934 exhibition in the Orangerie, Paris.⁵

A most valuable source of information pertaining to the drawings by Daumier is the extensive exhibition "Daumier Drawings", with 150 pieces on display, curated at The Metropolitan Museum of Art, New York, in 1992. It is the contemporaneous attempt to look at Daumier's drawings after the Paris retrospectives of 1901 and 1934. The exhibition featured casual spontaneous studies, as well as formal drawings, which manifest a self-sustaining character.⁶

As noted in the introduction to the Metropolitan Museum's catalogue, Daumier's fame beyond the borders of France culminated in Munich and Berlin, especially through the writings of the art critic

³ Baudelaire Dufays, C., Salon de 1845. Paris 1845, pp 11 f

⁴ Maison, Karl Eric: Honoré Daumier. Catalogue Raisonné of the Paintings, Watercolours and the Drawings. London, Thames & Hudson 1968

⁵ Daumier. Peintures, Aquarelles, Dessins. Musée de L'Orangerie, Paris 1934

⁶ Colta, Ives et al.: Daumier Drawings; New York, Met Publications 1992

Meier-Graefe, who was closely working together with the Munich publisher Reinhard Piper.⁷ For this particular provenance research, Paris, Munich and Berlin are critical in the attempt to identify the origins of this double-faced drawing.

It is crucial to emphasize that none of the monographs, exhibition catalogues, or auction catalogues, as reviewed in the next paragraphs of this provenance research report, has yielded any citing of this particular drawing.

- **Dating - LostArt 478051**

Most scholars regard the dating of Daumier drawings as an unattainable task. However, it is to be noted that there were two periods in the artist's life, during which he was productive in this medium, periods when his assignments with the French press were interrupted, in 1848 - 1950, in the aftermath of the revolution, and then in 1860, when his engagement with the publication of *Le Charivari* was interrupted.⁸

As most of Daumier's drawings dating from 1848-1850, in accordance with the Metropolitan catalogue, are considered to be preparatory to oil paintings, and as no painting was identified by the team for this particular male portrait, we may assume that it was created during the 1860s, a time Daumier produced drawings intended for private sale and viewed as independent pieces. In general, very few drawings were identified to which a parallel Oil painting could be attributed, although the fact that the male portrait on the recto of LostArt 478051 is a careful and naturalistic study may indeed point to this possibility.

However, the double-faced drawing challenges this dating, for the verso reveals a very spontaneous rendering of four male heads, which leave no doubt to the notion that they are preparatory by intent. This state of affairs makes one consider a relationship between recto and verso. A stipulation assumes a theatrical production, the portrait of an actor on recto, while the verso captures spectators, although they do not display gestures of an audience. A logical relationship between recto and verso could not be established, and thus they may have been created at two different occasions, and thus bear different dating.

- **Attempt at identifying the male portrait on recto and random male heads on verso:**

Recto:

The male portrait on recto manifests particulars of facial features, which may point to the assumption of the rendering of a particular person. A self-portrait in the DR (Daumier Register) under number 10021 titled "Bearded Man" or alternately the bronze "Self-portrait", collection of the Chicago Institute of Art,⁹ and DR 10037 "Portrait - presumably of Constantine Guys", formerly in the Gerstenberg collection,¹⁰ bear some resemblance to LostArt 478051; however, at the same time they

⁷ Ibid., p. VIII

⁸ Ibid., p. X

⁹ http://www.artic.edu/aic/collections/artwork/152762?search_no=5&index=0 (October 2017)

¹⁰ Daumier register, DR 10037

amplify the difficulty in accurate identification. A photograph of the artist¹¹ does bear resemblance to the LostArt 478051 portrait, but with no absolute certainty.

A closer look at the drawing may suggest a kinship with a drawing from the collection of the Musée du Louvre, Paris, "Head of a Man"¹² displaying a typology of a Herculean rendering. Daumier is using idealization to achieve classical influence, an imposing figure of a male, based on former studies of commoners, the classical traits serving as a means of appealing to potential buyers. The monogram at the lower left may support this hypothesis, as the artist did not sign random drawings.

Verso:

The studies of male heads are a repeated theme in Daumier's oeuvre. It manifests a spontaneous quick rendering of faces with a swift and skillful hand. Probably created by the artist for later use in his paintings or lithographs, it displays an impressive skill in capturing facial features and expressions.

The team identified no particular lithograph or painting pertaining to these heads. However, a study of Daumier's sculptural caricatures in clay reveals the following: the upper head in pen does bear resemblance to the sculptured bust of magistrate August Gady,¹³ pointed chin and hooked nose depicted.

At the same time, no parallels were identified for the remaining heads, thus negating the notion of parliamentary or judicial figures.

- **Similar works of art:**

Three Male Heads, The Metropolitan Museum of Art¹⁴.

The drawing in the Metropolitan Museum Collection bears great similarity to the verso of LostArt 478051. The provenance of this drawing indicates Katherina Riezler as source, originating with the former collection of Max Liebermann. This drawing is also depicted in the Maison monography.¹⁵

The two books on the fate and content of Liebermann's collection: "Die Kunstsammlung"¹⁶ and "Verlorene Schätze"¹⁷, do not yield any information on LostArt 478051. The Liebermann family has not submitted a claim. Moreover, a letter by the art investigation officer, May 3, 1947,¹⁸ attests to the fact that the heirs of the Liebermann collection, Mr. and Mrs. Riezler, are granted permission to ship four drawings by Honoré Daumier to the US, confirming that the family has been able to reclaim their possession. LostArt 478051 clearly did not originate with the Liebermann collection in Berlin.

¹¹ https://hammer.ucla.edu/collections/armand-hammer-daumier-and-contemporaries-collection/#gallery_b9c793d3cc432c834a1447a22626e61151a22cdb (October 2017)

¹² http://www.culture.gouv.fr/public/mistral/joconde_fr_RF_36798 (October 2017)

¹³ http://www.musee-orsay.fr/fr/collections/catalogue-des-oeuvres/notice.html?no_cache=1&numid=006344&cHash=1fea01978b (October 2017)

¹⁴ <http://www.metmuseum.org/art/collection/search/334358> (October 2017)

¹⁵ Maison, Karl Eric. Honoré Daumier: Catalogue Raisonné of the Paintings, Watercolours and the Drawings. London, Thames & Hudson 1968

¹⁶ Hedinger, B.: Max Liebermann – Die Kunstsammlung; München 2013

¹⁷ Faass, M.: Verlorene Schätze; Berlin 2013

¹⁸ <https://www.fold3.com/image/269975816> (October 2017)

- **Analysis of physical findings:**

The number "8" inscribed in pencil on both recto and verso on matting was identified as the number "8" in the document titled "Liste Gérard", and identified as "Daumier Dessin double face". Further discussion of this list see under primary sources in this document.

1. **Primary sources:**

- Hildebrandt Gurlitt Ledger No. 1¹⁹

This ledger lists a sale of a Daumier "*Männerkopf 2 (Z[?])*" for 2,000 RM, on May 28, 1942, to the buyer Reemtsma. Hermann Reemtsma was partner at the Reemtsma Cigarettenfabriken, in Altona-Bahrenfeld (Hamburg). The company, especially Philipp F. Reemtsma, was known for cooperation with the Nazi party in the attempt to retain the cigarettes manufacturing rights, and having close contacts with Herman Goering. However, Hermann Reemtsma himself has been accounted for protecting the Jewish employees of the company. After the capitulation in 1945, the company was put under the custody of the British Zone Military Rule until 1948, and by 1950 it was returned to the family. Hermann Reemtsma had a reputation as music lover and art collector.²⁰ A Hermann Reemtsma Foundation was established in 1962.²¹ In an attempt to verify the sale recorded in the ledger, the team has contacted the staff of the Reemtsma Foundation, and received the following response in July 2016. ²² "The oil painting 'Un Peintre' attributed in the past to Daumier was restituted by H. Reemtsma to France in 1948". A search in the MNR files yielded: MNR # 358 , which verifies this information. However, at a close look of the provenance of this item the following is revealed. The painting "*Un Peintre*" was put on sale by Drouot on Dec. 11 1942, and bought by André Schoeller for Hildebrandt Gurlitt of Dresden for the price of 76,400 RM.²³ Catalogue listing # 83 – "*Portrait d'un ami de l'artiste*", oil, H 27 W 225. Reproduction 22 clearly illustrates an oil painting.

- The sum of 2,000 RM, which appears in Ledger 1 is indicative of the fact that the item is a drawing, valued at a lower sum. The response by the Reemtsma Foundation bears no relevance to our research of LostArt # 478051, beyond the fact that a different Daumier was indeed sold by Gurlitt to Reemtsma for a much higher price. The false or manipulative registering of H. Gurlitt in the ledger constitutes another example of the challenges the ledger provides, pertaining to the accuracy of the information written by H. Gurlitt.
- Correspondence H. Gurlitt - Hermann Reemtsma.²⁴ In a letter dated July 1946, Hermann Reemtsma refers to items purchased by H. Gurlitt in Paris, and sold to him during the war years. Reemtsma is requested by the allies to report all works he bought during the war originating in foreign countries. He asks Gurlitt to verify the list. The list of works bought in an auction in Paris refers to:
 - Honoré Daumier "*Portrait eines Freundes*".

¹⁹ Gurlitt's_business_records_book_1, line 784

²⁰ https://de.wikipedia.org/wiki/Hermann-Hinrich_Reemtsma (October 2017)

²¹ <http://www.hermann-reemtsma-stiftung.de/> (October 2017)

²² Email [...] Stiftung Hermann F. Reemtsma, July 26, 2016: "Das von Hermann F. Reemtsma 1942 über Gurlitt erworbene Gemälde „Un peintre“, das früher Daumier zugeschrieben war, wurde von Hermann F. Reemtsma im Januar 1948 an Frankreich restituiert (Restitution Claim 2426)"

²³ http://digi.ub.uni-heidelberg.de/diglit/drouot1942_12_11 (October 2017)

²⁴ Korrespondenz der Familie Gurlitt (1944 – 1967) – Auswahl für die Forschung zu NS-Raubgut

The question as to the possibility that this citing refers to LostArt 478051 has been negated. Furthermore, we believe there was a misreading of “Z” referring to *Zeichnung*, in place of the numeric 2, as suggested in the transcript of Ledger 1. Which thus confirms our hypothesis.

In regards to the MNR listing of the painting “*Un Peintre*” as *formerly* attributed to Daumier, attesting to the fact of an error in the past, does bring to mind the questionable attribution of Daumier’s Don Quixote in the Gurlitt cache to this artist, and the suspicion of a fake. That André Schoeller is involved in both transactions amplifies this suspicion.

- Declaration of property by H. Gurlitt, 26.8.1945.²⁵ In this declaration, H. Gurlitt attests the following: Honoré Daumier’s “Portrait of a friend” has been sold to Mr. Reemtsma confirming the information submitted by the Reemtsma Foundation and the act of restitution to France. .
- Letter by H. Gurlitt to CCP Munich, Oct 3 1946.²⁶ Report of sales to private persons on p. 3 - Daumier “Portrait d’un Monsieur”, Hermann Reemtsma.
- Correspondence H. Gurlitt - Hermann Reemtsma, 13.11.1947.²⁷ A letter from Gurlitt to Reemtsma attesting to the sale of works during the war years, and reported to the Allies. Daumier “*Herren Portrait*” refers to the oil painting discussed in the previous paragraph.

Hildebrandt Gurlitt Ledger no. 2.²⁸ Line 1576 dated June 20, 1941 records a “Daumier Männerkopf”, oil, as being purchased by Gurlitt from Jean Lenthal, Paris. This line by H. Gurlitt indicates this item to be an oil painting, and a total sum price of 50,000 RM registered for the entire lot. The date given by Gurlitt predates the provenance listed by the MNR pertaining to “*Un Peintre*”. However, it is to be noted that the Jean Lenthal sale records in the Gurlitt’s ledger have been proven to be a falsified record. J. Lenthal was only posing as buyer by request of Gurlitt, and clearly was not the owner of the items listed under his name.²⁹ Thus dating should also be questioned.

- Hildebrandt Gurlitt Ledger no. 3,³⁰ line 3136, August 3, 1943, undisclosed lot by Daumier was sold to Paul Roemer, Berlin, for the sum of 6,000 RM.
- Hildebrandt Gurlitt Ledger no 4, a listing dated once more May 28, 1942, indicates once more a payment of 2,000 RM. No title or medium are listed, however, the team assumes it reiterates ledger 1 and 2.
- **Photographs of recto and verso of drawing found in the Salzburg documents³¹.**

²⁵ <https://www.fold3.com/image/270055163> (October 2017)

²⁶ <https://www.fold3.com/image/270055638> and 270065528 (October 2017)

²⁷ Korrespondenz der Familie Gurlitt (1944 – 1967) – Auswahl für die Forschung zu NS-Raubgut, 00319

²⁸ Excel table Gurlitt’s_business_records_book_2, line 1576

²⁹ According to the extant sale ledgers, this was one of about forty works that Gurlitt claimed to have acquired from the art dealer Jean Lenthal in Paris on 20 June 1942. Research by the Taskforce revealed these entries false. Post-war correspondence between Gurlitt and Lenthal, which was found in Cornelius Gurlitt’s Salzburg residence, proved that Gurlitt coerced Lenthal into issuing fake receipts for works that Lenthal never owned or sold. Gurlitt provided Lenthal with a statement to this effect in 1947.

Jean Lenthal (recte Hans Loewenthal, 1914 Vienna–1983 Paris) was an art dealer in Paris. On account of his Jewish descent, Lenthal was deported in 1943, first to Drancy and thereafter to Auschwitz, Sachsenhausen and Mauthausen concentration camps. After the liberation in 1945, Lenthal returned to live in Paris where he resumed his art dealership

³⁰ Excel table Gurlitt’s_business_records_book_3, line 3136

³¹ 9.1_F945_Daumier_Herrenporträt_V

André Schoeller provides an expert verification to the authenticity of the double face Daumier drawing. This verification took place in Paris on January 27th 1944, following the purchase of the work from an undisclosed buyer or seller. It might have been issued for R. Gérard or H. Gurlitt, in anticipation of the future sale of this work in Germany, and prior to the transfer of works b H. Gurlitt to Germany. It was the custom of art dealers to provide buyers with authentication of art works.

André Schoeller, 1898 - 1991, expert on 19th century art, served as appraiser for Parisian art dealers. According to the American Art Looting Intelligence Unit, his reputation is tainted. After the war he continued to direct his dealership and act as fraudulent art pieces and was involved in court trials on accusations concerning these matters.

“Schoeller, André. Paris, 13 rue de Teheran. Well known expert in French 19th century painting. President of the Art Editors Syndicate and appraiser for the Hotel Drouot. Appraised paintings confiscated by the ERR. Sold extensively to Wuester, Brueschwiler and Lohse. Possibly involved in the Schloss Collection confiscation, as informer.”³²

Additional information on Schoeller provided:

Address: 13 Rue de Teheran, Paris.

Occupation: Dealer

Expert in modern painting said to be a collaborator, an opportunist and a gambler, probably rather unscrupulous.³³

Hector Feliciano, in his book “The Lost Museum”³⁴, alludes to the questionable business practices of Schoeller during the German occupation of France, specifically his sale of a Daumier to the Folkwang Museum.

- H. Gurlitt Correspondence.³⁵ In a letter of April 10, 1940 Norbert Ketterer reports of a return of items 66-70. Following this letter H. Gurlitt acknowledges Daumier receipt to Ketterer, i.e., confirming the receipt of the items in a package. The value of the reported items, 5 sheets for 100 RM, are indicative of lithographs, and thus not relevant to the original double sided drawing in question.
- Liste Gérard.³⁶ The typewritten list of 70 works of art, signed by Raphaël Gérard Paris, 28.4.1944 (signature erased presumably by H. Gurlitt) was found in Cornelius Gurlitt's Salzburg residence, and researched with a report by Dr. Gramlich. It is presumed that until the signature's date, these works were in the possession of R. Gérard's art dealership in Paris, and after that in the possession of H. Gurlitt until 1953. No. 8 on this list is noted as:

Daumier Dessin double face – corresponding to LostArt 478051.

³² <https://www.fold3.com/image/270270453> (October 2017)

³³ <https://www.fold3.com/image/231986227> (October 2017)

³⁴ H. Feliciano: The lost museum. New York 1995, p 232

³⁵ Korrespondenz der Familie Gurlitt (1944 – 1967), Letter Ketterer to Gurlitt, 021

³⁶ Gramlich, J. Quellendokumente zu Paper I5, Muenchen 2015; Dok. 1

This document serves as the basis for the provenance of this drawing.

It is to be noted that the serial no. "8" is inscribed on both sides of the matting, and thus similar references should be made in regards to items found in the C. Gurlitt cachet, as cross-referencing of findings may result in solving similar questions regarding the researched works of art.

- Liste Gérard analysis: 55 of the works in the original "Liste Gérard" were found in C. Gurlitt's possession, and the YV team has listed the corresponding LostArt numbers to each of the artworks, for further identification by provenance researchers assigned to these works.

Although not under the charter of the Task Force investigation, the missing items that may have been sold by C. Gurlitt before the Bavarian authorities confiscated the cachet, are subject for future investigations.

- Helene Gurlitt List.³⁷ The seven page document handwritten by Helene Gurlitt, excluding last page with Raphaël Gérard's hand writing, found in the Salzburg residence, corresponds to "Liste Gérard"³⁸, with the addition of 4 works, totaling 74 works of art. No. 8 in both documents refers to Daumier *Zweiseitige Zeichnung*, with the added information that the drawing was taken out of its frame. The list was compiled by Helene in September 1953, a time a transport to Germany of works from the Gurlitt collection in Paris was carried out. The works are grouped into the following categories: Lost, Taken out of frame, Acquired, Remaining. The Daumier LostArt #478051 is listed as "8" under 'taken out of frame'. According to Dr. Gramlich, these 34 items were brought on September 22 to the framing shop Pierre Renevey, after which they were packed for shipment to Germany..
- Invoice Pierre Renevey.³⁹ The invoice clearly verifies the fact that 34 works are to be unframed, and an additional sum is requested for the lining of a crate. A listing in Helene Gurlitt's calendar pertaining to the transfer of works on the 22 of September acts as an additional proof to the transfer of works. To be noted that the invoice is made to a certain unidentified Monsieur BEAUPE (Beaupré ?) who may have acted on behalf of Mrs. H. Gurlitt.
- **Inquiries to Task Force regarding claims pertaining to Daumier LostArt 478051**

Estella Katzenellenbogen: Inquiry regarding a Daumier Drawing, no specifics were submitted.⁴⁰

According to claimant, the items were sold on October 2-3 at the auction house "Union" in Berlin Dahlem. Auctioned off to Lange for 1,175 RM.

In a copy of auctioned items # 717 on list: Drawing Daumier, Lange 1,175⁴¹

³⁷ Gramlich, loc. cit. Dok. 2

³⁸ Gramlich, loc. cit. Dok. 1

³⁹ Gramlich, loc. cit. Dok. 7

⁴⁰ http://www.lostart.de/Webs/DE/Datenbank/EinzelobjektSucheSimpel.html?cms_param=EOBJ_ID%3D304727%26SUCHE_ID%3D24702491 (October 2017)

⁴¹ Brandenburgisches Landeshauptarchiv: Oberfinanzpraesident; Akte Nr. 64585

To be noted: The family name Gurlitt does appear in the sales catalogue as buyer. However, we assume that it refers to Hildebrandt's cousin Wolfgang Gurlitt, an active Gallerist and buyer in Berlin during this period although there is no proof to this hypothesis.

The team views this claim as unconfirmed. The sale catalogue clearly indicates sale to Lange. Furthermore, the Daumier drawing found in the C. Gurlitt cache originated according to the provenance outline in the collection of Raphaël Gérard, Paris, thus negating the notion that it was sold in Berlin.

- Margarete Scharf⁴². Inquiry regarding 19 drawings by several artists including Daumier, no specifics were submitted

The Otto Gerstenberg collection is notable for the substantial number of Daumier's graphic works in its holding, the majority of which probably were lithographs, although in Germany the term 'graphic' may indicate works on paper as well.

The collection also included 30 oil paintings by the artist. Gerstenberg acquired most of his art in Paris through local art dealerships, by way of his company's agents in this city.⁴³

Otto Gerstenberg sold old masters from his collection in 1922, and after his death in 1935, his daughter Margarete Scharf inherited the collection. Due to the fact that her residence could not hold her father's collection in its entirety, she deposited part of it in the store rooms of the Victoria insurance company on Lindenstrasse in Berlin. The building was bombed by the allies and all works were destroyed. As the bombing of the city by the allies endangered the collection in her residence, Margarete Scharf deposited the more valuable pieces at the Nationalgalerie for safekeep. For that purpose the Nationalgalerie used the "Zoo Bunker" and the "Friedrichshain Bunker".

A location index of the Nationalgalerie lists works owned by the gallery and other owners, stored for safe keeping in the vaults of the Reichsbank, was addressed. The list on p. 9 refers to 3 works of art by Daumier, Honoré, owner : Margarete Scharff.⁴⁴ The works listed are: The Burden, The Riot, Washerwomen on the banks of the Seine. None of these correspond to LostArt 478051, and are probably oil paintings.

An additional line on p. 10 of this document refers to a collection of 19 drawings by Daumier and others, with no further details. They were placed in the Schinkel Hall.

When the Red Army conquered this part of Berlin it transferred the collection to the Soviet Union. Parts of this collection until this very day are items of confiscated art in the collections of the Hermitage and Pushkin Museums. The remainder of the collection was transferred by Mrs. Scharf to Oberstdorf, Bavaria. For financial reasons Mrs. Scharf needed to sell parts of the collection after the war. The remainder of the collection is currently under the ownership of the foundation of the Dieter Scharf collection in Berlin.⁴⁵

⁴²

http://www.lostart.de/Webs/DE/Datenbank/EinzelobjektSucheSimpel.html?cms_param=EOBJ_ID%3D5000001457%26SUCHE_ID%3D24702521 (October 2017)

⁴³ https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Scharf-Gerstenberg_Collection (October 2017)

⁴⁴ <https://www.fold3.com/image/231927837> (October 2017)

⁴⁵ https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Scharf-Gerstenberg_Collection (October 2017)

Paintings were deposited at the Flakturm Zoo,⁴⁶ however, the document does not refer to either a Daumier or to items from M. Scharf's collection.

The evidence collected hitherto does not support the notion that LostArt 478051 originated with the Scharf collection. The evidence may lead to the direction of the Russian looting, and should be carefully searched at the Hermitage and Pushkin collections, where other items from the former Gerstenberg collection are known to have been deposited.

Monographs and books with no direct reference to LostArt 478051:

Extensive research was conducted pertaining to the double sided drawing LostArt 478051 in an attempt to find the drawing in monographs, exhibition catalogues and auction catalogues, but to no avail. Taking into account the large number of drawings, estimated at about 800, in Honoré Daumier's oeuvre, this is quite plausible, and currently we have no suspicion as to its authenticity. The following publications were consulted:

Berlin team:

Klossowski, Erich. Honoré Daumier. Munich: R. Piper & Co., 1923.

Lejeune, Robert. Honoré Daumier. Cologne, Berlin: Kiepenheuer & Witsch, 1953.

Adhémar, Jean. Honoré Daumier. Paris: Éditions Pierre Tisné, 1954.

Maison, Karl Eric. Honoré Daumier: Catalogue Raisonné of the Paintings, Watercolours and the drawings, London, Thames & Hudson 1968

Scharf, Julietta, and Hanna Strzoda, eds. Die Historische Sammlung Otto Gerstenberg: Sammlungsverzeichnis. With the collaboration of Janina Dahlmanns. Ostfildern: Hatje Cantz, 2012.

Max-Liebermann-Gesellschaft Berlin, ed. Verlorene Schätze: Die Kunstsammlung von Max Liebermann. Exh. cat., Liebermann-Villa, Berlin, 24 November 2013–3 March 2014.

Author of the report:

J. Adhémar: Doctors and medicine in the works of Honoré Daumier. Boston 1960.

J. Adhémar: Honoré Daumier. Paris 1954.

A. Alexandre: Daumier. Paris 1928.

K. Bartels: Honoré Daumier als Lithograph. München 1908.

P. Black (ed.): Daumier and his contemporaries. London 1988.

Daumier. Bibliothèque Nationale, Paris 1934.

⁴⁶ <https://www.fold3.com/image/271038276> (October 2017)

- Daumier 1808 – 1879. Exh. cat. Pennsylvania Museum of Art, Philadelphia 1937.
- Die Daumier-Sammlung Carl O. Schniewind, New York. Auct. cat., C.G. Boerner und Gutekunst & Klippstein, Leipzig, 23 May 1933.
- Dessins originaux de Daumier. Collection René G.-D., auct. cat Paris 1966.
- P. Ducatel: Les premières années de caricatures politiques d’Honoré Daumier, Paris 2000.
- R. Escholier, Daumier: Peintre et lithographe. Paris: Floury, 1923.
- E. Fuchs (ed.): Der Maler Daumier. Muenchen 1929.
- J. Ezratty: Antarès Estampes. Bronze et lithographies de Daumier. Exh. cat. Bernheim-Jeune, Paris 1968.
- M. Gauthier: Daumier. Paris 1939.
- C. Holme (ed.) Daumier and Gavarni, London 1904.
- Honoré Daumier. Ausstellung. Exh. cat. Museum Sztuki w Łodzi 1992.
- Honoré Daumier. Ausstellung. Exh. cat. Galerie Matthiesen, Berlin 1926.
- Honoré Daumier. The Armand Hammer Daumier Collection. Los Angeles 1982.
- Honoré Daumier – Götter und Helden. München 1947.
- Honoré Daumier. Impressions of modern life. Exh. cat. Boerner, New York 2000.
- Honoré Daumier und sein Kreis. Exh. cat. Hamburg 1962.
- H. James: Daumier. Emmaus, PA 1954..
- J. R. Kist: Daumier. Exh. cat. Victoria & Albert Museum, London 1976.
- E. Klossowski, Honoré Daumier. Muenchen 1923.
- O. W. Larkin: Daumier. New York 1966.
- J. Lassaigue: Daumier. Paris 1947.
- B. Laughton: The drawings of Daumier and Millet Daumier. New Haven 1991.
- B. Laughton: Honoré Daumier. New Haven 1996.
- M. Lecomte: Daumier Sculpteur. Paris 1979.
- R. Lejeune: Honoré Daumier. Berlin 1953.
- Lithographs by Honoré Daumier. Auct. cat. Christie’s, London 1994.
- K.E. Maison: Honoré Daumier: Cat. raisonné of the paintings, watercolours and drawings, vol. 1. San Francisco 1996.
- K.E. Maison: Honoré Daumier: Cat. raisonné of the paintings, watercolours and drawings, vol. 2. San Francisco 1996.
- Max-Liebermann-Gesellschaft Berlin (ed.). Verlorene Schätze: Die Kunstsammlung von Max Liebermann. Exh. cat. Liebermann-Villa, Berlin, 24 November 2013 – 3 March 2014.

E. Mongan (ed.): Daumier in retrospective. Exh. cat. Los Angeles County Museum of Art 1979.

J. Mossinger (ed.): Honoré Daumier. Exh. cat. Chemnitz 2002.

R. Passeron: Daumier. New York 1979.

R. Rey: Honoré Daumier. New York [1963?].

Sammlung E. F., Berlin. Auct. cat. C. G. Boerner, Leipzig, 23–24 May 1938.

Sammlung Honoré Daumier. Auct. cat. Kornfeld & Klipstein, Bern, 14 June 1968.

J. Scharf (ed): Die Historische Sammlung Otto Gerstenberg. Ostfildern 2012.

J. Schultze: Honoré Daumier. Ausstellung. Exh. cat. Bremen 1980.

Stiftung Brandenburger Tor (ed.). "Daumier ist ungeheuer!" Gemälde, Zeichnungen, Graphik, Bronzen von Honoré Daumier. Exh. cat. Max Liebermann Haus, Berlin, 2 March–2 June 2013.

M. Stuffmann (ed): Honoré Daumier: Zeichnungen Exh. cat., Städelsches Kunstinstitut and Städtische Galerie, Frankfurt a. M., New York, 1992/93.

H. P. Vincent: Daumier and his world. Evanston 1968.

Exhibition catalogues with no direct reference to LostArt 478051:

Exposition des Peintures et Dessins de H. Daumier, Paris, 1878.

Exposition Daumier, Palais de l'Ecole des Beaux-Arts, Paris, 1901.

Honoré Daumier. Ausstellung. Exh. cat. Galerie Matthiesen, Berlin, 1926.

Corot Daumier; Museum of Modern Art; New York 1930.

Daumier 1808 – 1879. Pennsylvania Museum of Art, Philadelphia 1937.

Exhibition "Paintings from Berlin Museums", National Gallery of Art, Washington D.C., 1948.

Daumier. Paintings and drawings. Arts Council of Great Britain, London 1961.

Daumier 1808 – 1879. Musée des Beaux-Arts, Ottawa 2000.

Staatliche Museen zu Berlin; The eccentric gaze, 2013.

Auction catalogues with no direct reference to LostArt 478051:

Tableaux Modernes – Aquarelles, Pastels, Dessins - Collection de M. Hazard. Galerie George Petit, Paris, December 1-3, 1919

Die Handzeichnungssammlung Prof. Paul Arndt, München. C.G. Boerner Leipzig, May 16, 1934

Tableaux – Pastels, Aquarelles, Dessins. Hotel Drouot, Paris, December 21, 1942

Catalogue des Tableaux et Objets d'Ameublement. Hotel Drouot, Paris, February 10, 1943

Catalogue des Estampes ... composant la Collection de Monsieur Georges Viau. Hotel Drouot, Paris, February 26, 1943

Les Ventes de Tableaux – Aquarelles, Gouaches, Dessins, Miniatures.

Hotel Drouot, Paris, September 1942 – July 1943

Conclusions:

Although many sources were consulted, LostArt 478051 was not found in any of the monographs, exhibition catalogues, and auction catalogues. The only evidence was identified in the primary sources, which may allude to the fact that it was in private ownership for a long period. Taking into consideration the large output of drawings by Daumier, numbering in the hundreds, it is no surprise that not all are listed, but indicative it was not in the open market for sale, or known to scholars and curators for sake of publication or exhibitions display and catalogues.

The importance of Liste Gérard and the authentication photograph by André Schoeller is by the fact that they provide final proof of LostArt 478051 Paris provenance during the occupation and illegal transfer to Germany.

The falsified J. Lenthal ownership as seller augments the suspicion of looting the identity of dubious owner, which H. Gurlitt refrained from including in his ledger.

Die Provenienz der Zeichnung konnte trotz intensiver Forschung für die Zeit 1933 bis 1945 nicht lückenlos aufgeklärt werden, d.h. das Werk ist weder erwiesenermaßen noch mit hoher Wahrscheinlichkeit NS-Raubkunst noch frei von NS-Raubkunstverdacht [=Ampelsystem: gelb].⁴⁷

Disclaimer

The research that goes into establishing the provenance of a work of art usually requires complex work that often lasts many years. Researchers have to reconstruct events that took place many decades ago. Often, the only sources of vital clues stem from third parties who do not always represent and assess the facts in a manner that is beyond all doubt. The above object record is just an interim report that was designed as a basis to facilitate possible further in-depth research. Despite the short period of time in which it was compiled, this interim report is nevertheless the result of utmost care in research, combined with great professional expertise. The following provisions therefore apply:

- a) The investigation revolved exclusively around the question of the origin and chronology of ownership of the artwork described in the report. No liability will be accepted for:
 - the accuracy of the used sources' presentation of the facts and any analyses, conclusions, and assessments they may contain,
 - the exhaustiveness of our probing into and evaluation of the available source material,
 - the analysis and conclusions drawn from the sources in the course of our research,

⁴⁷ Ergänzung der Projektleitung, 12.12.2017.

- the findings on the subject of the report and how they were derived,
 - the authenticity of the artwork, as well as the accuracy of its attribution to a particular artist.
- b) The report is based on the sources available at the time it was written. It is an interim report. Further research might be required. It is important to note the possibility that new source material may be found, which may lead to a re-evaluation of the interim findings presented here.
- c) The present report does not purport to make pronouncements on any legal claims and legal positions. No liability will be accepted for any conclusions drawn by the addressee(s) or by third parties based on this report.